

APO Recommendations to CPC for the Facilities Master Plan 2003-2015 Evaluation

Introduction and Background:

In spring 2016, the Assessment of Planning and Outcomes (APO), subcommittee of the College Planning Council (CPC) committed to evaluating the Facilities Master Plan 2003-2015. Evaluation is part of APO's role to evaluate the planning and institutional effectiveness including related documents and plans. The work of evaluating the Facilities Master Plan began at the October 13, 2016, meeting and continued for the next three meetings on October 27, November 10, and December 8, 2016. Committee members were tasked with reading the plan prior to the October 27 meeting and began to review and complete a qualitative evaluation of the Facilities Master Plan.

APO found that there were four goals, along with projections of enrollment headcount.

GOALS	EVALUATION
1. Renovate and expand the Palm Desert Campus	Completed
2. Acquire and develop a new Eastern Valley Center	Completed
3. Operate a Western Valley Center	In Progress <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Palm Springs Mall • DHS Wenzlaff Center
4. Expand online instruction and use of other Coachella Valley sites	In Progress

	HEADCOUNT PROJECTED IN 2015	HEADCOUNT IN FALL 2015	EVALUATION
Palm Desert	8,886	9,822	Exceeded Headcount
Eastern Valley Center	3,487	2,844 • Indio: 2,427 • Mecca/Thermal: 417	Did not met expected headcount
Distance Learning	759	2,313	Exceeded Headcount
Other Sites	1,459	937	Did not met expected headcount
Total	14,591	15,916	Exceeded Total Headcount

Recommendations to CPC:

Recommendation #1: Review and utilize the APO evaluation of the 2003-15 Facility Master Plan to inform the new Facilities Master Plan scheduled to be written in spring 2017 following the Educational Master Plan.

Recommendation #2: Recommend that Facilities Advisory Committee review and add to APO's Evaluation of the Facilities Master Plan.

Recommendation #3: Recommend that Facilities Advisory Committee to regularly review and update the Facilities Master Plan.*

*Please note that the last Facilities Master Plan was not reviewed regularly or updated over a 12-year period. At minimum, the Facilities Master Plan should be reviewed within three years.

Rubric	• Completed	• Met
	• Did Not Complete	• Not Met
	• In Progress	• Other

Qualitative Evaluation of Facilities Master Plan 2003-2015

Updated 2/16/2017

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
LEARNING COMMONS (pages 35-36) – Total of 100,000 AFS & estimated cost of \$20,518,000 for the new Commons planning, construction and equipment.					
A) Learning Commons <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 49,500 ASF* new construction One-stop student center Located southeast between library and dining hall 	Cravens Student Services Center completed 2009 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$15,850,348 48,132 sq. ft. Located at the entrance of Monterey Avenue 	Registration (Admissions & Records), assessment, counseling, financial aid, special programs, and bookstore		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Academic Skills Center & Tutoring To be located between Library and Dining buildings 	Completed
B) Renovation of Dining Hall <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 13,500 ASF 	Dining Hall renovation completed 2010 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$3,560,000 14,715 sq. ft. 	Improved food service facilities, gathering areas and offices for Student Life and ASCOD		Did not complete cyber café and student activities	Completed but large areas were omitted from initial scope
C) Renovation of Library <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 35,700 ASF 	In Progress: HILB building will house the library, academic skills center and tutoring.				Did not complete
ALUMNI CENTER (page 37) – Total of 3,000 AFS & estimated cost of \$1,242,000					
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> New facility for the Alumni Association with private entrance for Street Fair vendors, and separate area for staff offices New facility to be located west or north of the college entrance 	Alumni Centre completed in 2009 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 3,500 sq. ft. Total cost \$2,034,000 Located in NW corner of campus where the Street Fair is located 	Offices for Alumni Association staff			Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 64% over budget 17% over sq. ft.

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
INFORMATION TECHNOLOGY (pages 37-38) – Total of 24,740 ASF & estimated cost of \$11,736,000					
Dual use facility could be located just southwest of the existing Nursing building	Math Science Technology Center (MSTC) Completed 2012: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$16,660,000 40,200 sq. ft. Located just east of ASC and Math buildings 				Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 42% over budget 38% more sq. ft.
A) Proposed new IT building would be dedicated to conduct courses in computer science, computer information systems (applications), digital design and production and other courses related to IT --- classrooms, computer labs, faculty offices and supporting spaces for instruction would total 15,200 ASF		MSTC provides additional Science laboratories and 6 classrooms	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> MESA program offices and common area Business building renovation included computer science classes, DDP classes and some faculty offices 	CIS, DDP and other courses related to IT conducted in the Business building	See above Wet labs are located above IT
B) House administrative computing, learning resources (AV/TV/Media), and the college's infrastructure for online and other distance learning for a total of 9,540 ASF		Houses the College's Information Technologies department		Dedicated space for online and other distance learning	See above

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
BUSINESS AND COMMUNITY CENTER (page 38) – Total of 24,740 AFS & estimated cost of \$13,432,000					
Location could be at several corners of campus					
A) House the expansion of space for the new Center for Training and Development (formerly Economic Development and Community Education) at 12,740 ASF	Lease contract in Westfield Palm Desert Mall for PaCE				Did Not Complete
B) Along with Coachella Valley's only ballroom-style flexible auditorium space of 12,000 ASF for large group trainings and workforce preparation, and a state-of-the art Culinary Arts teaching kitchen	Lease contract in Westfield Palm Desert Mall for PaCE		Culinary Arts classes renovated mildly in Liberal Arts building		Did Not Complete
NURSING AND ALLIED HEALTH CENTER (pages 38-39) – Total of 10,000 AFS & estimated cost of \$5,006,000					
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Facility will include learning rooms, lab and demonstration areas, offices and support facilities Location would be adjacent to the existing Nursing building 	Baker Nursing Complex completed in 2009: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$10,980,372 14,000 sq. ft. Located adjacent to Nursing building 	Labs, classrooms and office spaces			Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 119% over budget 40% more sq. ft.

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
PUBLIC SAFETY ACADEMY (page 39) – Total of 24,740 AFS & estimated cost of \$13,432,000					
<p>A) The structure would house the Public Safety Academy (PSA) police and fire training programs. Space for classrooms, offices for faculty and advisors, an indoor pistol and rifle range, training and exercise center, emergency command post, mock police and fire stations, a burn building and training tower for a total of 62,000 ASF</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Extramural funding may augment the cost of this facility • Location could be at the NW or NE corner of campus • The training and live burn tower (TBT) must be located at a site away from the Palm Desert campus in Thousand Palms or a site adjacent to the Colmac green waste burning plant near Thermal 	<p>Public Safety Academy completed in 2009</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$15,978,064 • 13,500 sq. ft. • Located in the NE corner of campus 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Space for classrooms, offices for faculty and advisors, an indoor pistol and rifle range, training and exercise center, emergency command post, mock police and fire stations • TBT located in Thousand Palms 	<p>Office space for staff and faculty</p>		<p>Completed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 19% over budget • 45% less sq. ft.

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
FITNESS AND WELLNESS (pages 39-40) – Total of 6,000 AFS & estimated cost of \$3,024,000					
The new facility will be located just north of the Gym and east of existing shower/locker facility and swimming pool area					
A) Fitness center at 3,000 ASF	Athletic Facilities completed in 2015 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$22,265,238 • 18,894 sq. ft. • New gymnasium, team rooms, restrooms, shower/locker rooms and maintenance facilities for the PE and Athletics programs 	New gym with team rooms, restrooms, shower/locker rooms and maintenance facilities - gym has its own grounds keeper	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The concession stands have been converted to coaches' office • Basketball courts not up to regulation after completion of gym. Additional funds used to correct errors 		636% over budget
B) Two multi-purpose active learning classrooms, a training room and storage for PE equipment at 3,000 ASF	Athletics Facilities Completed in 2015 (see above): <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Renovate Kinesiology building to accommodate weight training, multipurpose rooms and faculty/staff offices 				

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
MULTI-USE ARTS FACILITY (pages 40-41) – Total of 6,000 AFS & estimated cost of \$11,830,000					
<p>The new facility would provide functional spaces for the Music, Music Annex, Art and Technology/Art buildings on the Palm Desert campus</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Location could be just west of the Business and Community Center or NE corner of campus 	Did not complete				Did not complete
<p>A) Instructional space with active learning classrooms, office and learning resource support, space allocated for choral/vocal, instrumental and dance at 12,000 ASF</p>	<p>Stagecraft Shop completed in 2014:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$1.9 million 3,346 sq. ft. located North of Theater Too 	<p>The facility supports theater arts with workshop, costume shop, makeup studio with changing facilities, and music/vocal practice rooms</p>			<p>Completed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 72% less sq. ft.
<p>B) A 500-seat theater-type assembly area – the largest of its kind in the Coachella Valley – to house a variety of productions and events at 13,000 ASF</p>	Did not complete				Did not complete

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
VISUAL ARTS (page 41) – Total of 21,660 AFS & estimated cost of \$4,173,000					
A) Renovate the existing Art building at 13,600 ASF to improve facilities for painting, drawing, photography, design, papermaking sculpture and ceramics			Renovated for sky light and dark room for photography		Did not complete
B) New visual arts annex or separate facility of 8,060 ASF that includes classrooms, labs, shops, and studios, along with supporting services and offices <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Located would be next to the Art building 	Visual Arts building completed 2014: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$8,434,163 • 13,700 sq. ft. • located NW corner of campus, just north of Marks Center for Arts 	Lab and classrooms - classroom sizes are small and impacting FTEs			Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • 102% over budget of total cost • 37% less sq. ft.
CHILD DEVELOPMENT CENTER (page 41) – Total of 12,000 AFS & estimated cost of \$5,546,000					
A new facility will house staff offices, lab or demonstration spaces, food facilities, and other supporting areas at 12,000 ASF <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Location east of existing facility, between Nursing and Magnesia Falls Drive 	Early Child Education Completed 2014: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • \$5,620,000 • 10,314 sq. ft. • Located just west of CDC 	lab and support spaces			The plan was for two classrooms but only one was completed. In the observation section of the classroom the security cameras are not working.

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
ATHLETICS COMPLEX (pages 41-42) – Total of 7,400 AFS & estimated cost of \$7,330,000					
<p>A) Reconstructing and expanding stadium or field house building along with upgrading the adjacent grandstands at the western edge of the football field.</p> <p>The new facility will include shower and locker rooms, rooms for classes and meetings, a training room, equipment storage space, a press box, and offices for coaches at 7,400 ASF</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Estimate cost of \$2.6 million 	<p>Weight Room & Training Room completed in 2008</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The Athletics weight room and sports medicine center \$1,330,381 3,840 sq. ft. 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> The new building includes a weight room and trainers facility on either side (north and south) of the Stadium. Equipment room used for sports medicine and 50% used for training. 		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Stadium has not been competed or renovated No press box No grandstand 	<p>Completed</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 68% under budget including City of Palm Desert partnership 48% less sq. ft.
<p>B) Add seating on the east side of the football field, and refurbish and update the soccer, baseball, and softball fields</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Estimate cost of \$1.9 million 	<p>Did not complete: added seating on football and soccer fields</p>	<p>Portable seating on East side of bleacher on the football field</p>	<p>New tennis facilities and softball stadium in 2008</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> More seating to baseball field No quad Soccer seating No lighting on tennis facilities or softball fields 	<p>Completed</p>
<p>C) Redesign and renovation of the campus swimming pools to produce a complex, in partnership with the City of Palm Desert</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Estimate cost of \$2.8 million 	<p>Swimming pools are located at across the street in partnership with the city of Palm Desert</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Estimate cost of \$1 million 				<p>Completed</p>

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
ENVIRONMENTAL SCIENCE AND TECHNOLOGY (page 42) – Total of 5,040 AFS & estimated cost of \$2,859,000					
Expansion of programs to be located at existing site just south of Magnesia Falls Drive	Completed 2014 (part of Applied Sciences building) <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Total of 21,741 sq. ft. \$12,045,000 				Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 321% over budget 331% more sq. ft.
A) Add a 5,040 ASF classroom and office facility		Classroom, dean and faculty offices			Completed
B) Expand the existing nursery area for an orchard, gardens, and growing container stock <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Two greenhouses for Environmental Horticulture funded by federal grants 		New greenhouse and lath house			Completed
C) Construct two golf holes for turf grass instruction		two golf holes			Completed
D) Build a small facility for storage and maintenance					Did not complete
ADVANCE TRANSPORTATION (page 43) – Total of 12,500 AFS & estimated cost of \$6,642,000					
A new facility will include shops, labs and classrooms, office and learning resource support at 12,500 ASF <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Estimated cost \$ 6.6 million Located just east of existing Diesel Mechanics building 					Did not complete

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
SUSTAINABLE CAMPUS INFRASTRUCTURE (page 43) – Total of 12,500 AFS & estimated cost of \$27,140,000					
A) Water and sewer systems replacement – \$3 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
B) For Fire-Life Safety Code compliance, electrical and mechanical services to buildings on campus need corrections, including mechanical utilities in the main tunnel – \$8.7 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
C) Needed improvements for the library, swimming pool, and IT infrastructure – \$4.7 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
D) A new central Co-generation plant to heat and cool the campus' new buildings, including a gas-driven generator to reduce electricity usage – \$9.6 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
E) Xeriscaping, a form of campus landscaping that saves energy and water, should be installed – \$0.4 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
F) Buildings should be metered so as to monitor and save energy and also be (re)keyed to improve campus security – \$0.4 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
G) Campus outdoor lighting and signage need to be upgraded, including improved					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate

maps and building, classroom and office signs – \$0.3 million					
Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
STRUCTURAL BUILDING RENOVATION (page 44) – Total estimated cost of \$31,280,000					
Eliminate deficiencies and maintain Palm Desert Campus buildings at a functional level for their existing purposes at \$2.6 million each year over 12 years					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
A) Adequate number of “smart classrooms” with multi-projection capability, smart and white boards, wireless computer access, and the like					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
B) Many existing lecture rooms are sized to accommodate the active learning pedagogy					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
C) Fixed-station labs in both the natural and physical sciences are configured for the most effective teaching, including adjacent preparation and storage rooms					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
FUNCTIONAL BUILDING RENOVATION (page 44) – Total estimated cost of \$12,075,000					
Renovate a substantial amount of the existing Palm Desert campus space to new uses or functions, such as active learning classrooms, an integrated and centralized administration, improved maintenance, and storage.	Did not complete				Did not complete
SEISMIC RETROFITS (page 45) – Total estimated cost of \$23,460,000					
A series of building retrofits for seismic safety: A) Dining Hall at \$1 million B) Seismic correction to 17 other buildings that DSA noted as being deficient at \$23.5 million					Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
PARKING (page 45) – Total estimated cost of \$18,457,000					
Add 2,300 more parking spaces at the Palm Desert campus including both surface and structure	Completed		Construction of Photovoltaic Carports in parking lots 14, 19, and 27 were completed in 2014. New lots resulted in less staff parking spots		Forward to experts in Facilities Advisory Committee to evaluate
SITE DEVELOPMENT (page 45) – Total estimated cost of \$2,760,000					
A series of site development projects to relocate important functions like the Street Fair, redesign the “Alumni” road and other campus access roads, and a new north entrance from Magnesia Falls Drive	Magnesia Falls Entrance and Parking Lot completed in 2009 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$788,405 		Additional parking on the NE corner of campus		Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 71% under budget
EASTERN VALLEY CENTER (pages 45-48) – Total 182,575 ASF and estimated cost of \$92 million					
A significant portion of facilities planning is intended to improve access in the eastern Coachella Valley. The project will include spaces for lecture, lab, active learning, learning resources, offices, supporting spaces, and infrastructure, renovation, parking and site acquisition and development <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 80 – 100 acres site Located in a central area in the Eastern Valley 	Indio Education Center completed 2014 <ul style="list-style-type: none"> \$22 million 40,000 sq. ft. 	Classrooms and administration offices	Commercial retail space		Completed <ul style="list-style-type: none"> 76% under budget 78% less sq. ft.

Proposal/Initial Scope	Project Progress	Areas Located/Completed in Initial Scope	Areas Completed Not in Initial Scope	Omissions	Evaluation Cost & Square Footage (10% over/under)
OTHER VALLEY SITES (page 48) – Total estimated cost of \$30.4 million were it to be conducted on the Palm Desert Campus					
Expand instruction and services at a variety of sites throughout the Valley – high schools, work-sites, hospital/nursing facilities, public agencies, the Southeast mega education center, and the like.	Did not complete				
WESTERN VALLEY SITES (pages 48-49) – Total estimated cost of \$29 million is allocated for this project					
Lease, lease-purchase of a building with renovation, or purchase of a 30-40 acres and construction of a facility <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Location TBD • If COD were to purchase a site in Western Valley for around \$10 million, the overall funding could support the development and construction of a facility of as much as 37,500 ASF 	Did not complete				
DISTANCE LEARNING (page 49) – Total estimated cost of \$15.6 million in the form of instruction and support space					
Developing infrastructure for operating a variety of distance learning experiences, emphasizing online instruction through a “hybrid” model which students take courses on campus and off campus – including televised,					

<p>inter-active video, and online instruction</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none">• The infrastructure for Distance Learning is to be located in the IT building with space for faculty training, supporting technicians, help desks, servers and other necessary support					
---	--	--	--	--	--